South African Journal of Botany xxx (2016) xxx-xxx



Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

# South African Journal of Botany



journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/sajb

## Evolution of 'smoke' induced seed germination in pyroendemic plants

## J.E. Keeley <sup>a,b,\*</sup>, J.G. Pausas <sup>c</sup>

<sup>a</sup> US Geological Survey, Western Ecological Research Center, Sequoia Field Station, Three Rivers, CA 93271, USA

<sup>b</sup> Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology, University of California, Los Angeles, CA 90095, USA

<sup>c</sup> CIDE-CSIC, Ctra. Naquera Km 4.5 (IVIA), Montcada, Valencia 46113, Spain

### A R T I C L E I N F O

Available online xxxx

Edited by MI Daws

### ABSTRACT

Pyroendemics are plants in which seedling germination and successful seedling recruitment are restricted to immediate postfire environments. In many fire-prone ecosystems species cue their germination to immediate postfire conditions. Here we address how species have evolved one very specific mechanism, which is using the signal of combustion products from biomass. This is often termed 'smoke' stimulated germination although it was first discovered in studies of charred wood effects on germination of species strictly tied to postfire conditions (pyroendemics). Smoke stimulated germination has been reported from a huge diversity of plant species. The fact that the organic compound karrikin (a product of the degradation of cellulose) is a powerful germination cue in many species has led to the assumption that this compound is the only chemical responsible for smokestimulated germination. Here we show that smoke-stimulated germination is a complex trait with different compounds involved. We propose that convergent evolution is a more parsimonious model for smoke stimulated germination, suggesting that this trait evolved multiple times in response to a variety of organic and inorganic chemical triggers in smoke. The convergent model is congruent with the evolution of many other fire-related traits.

Published by Elsevier B.V. on behalf of SAAB.

### Contents

1.	Introduction
2.	Combustion products that stimulate germination
3.	Evolution
	nowlegements
Refe	rrences

### 1. Introduction

Since the middle of the 20th century fire-induced seed germination has been widely reported in at least four of the five Mediterranean climate ecosystems of the world (Keeley et al., 2012). In California many annual species are almost entirely restricted to the immediate year or two after fire and thus have been described as pyroendemics as many of these species are present only in the first year or two after fire. Many Mediterranean woody species also show germination to be restricted to the immediate postfire environment and their lifetime

E-mail address: jon\_keeley@usgs.gov (J.E. Keeley).

recruitment comprises a single pulse of germination in the first postfire year.

The earliest studies on fire-stimulated germination focused on the role of heat in breaking seed coat permeability (e.g., Sweeney, 1956; Mott and McKeon, 1979; Jefferey et al., 1988; Trabaud and Oustric, 1989a,b). However, the world changed in 1977 with the report of charred wood stimulated germination of the postfire chaparral annual *Emmenanthe penduliflora* (Boraginaceae) (Wicklow, 1977), later confirmed by Jones and Schlesinger (1980) and Keeley and Nitzberg (1984). Wicklow's study was the first report of chemicals from biomass combustion playing a role in stimulating germination of postfire species.

In 1990 De Lange and Boucher reported the same phenomenon of combustion products simulating the germination in a species from the family Bruniaceae in South African fynbos, but used smoke or a leachate

http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.sajb.2016.07.012 0254-6299/Published by Elsevier B.V. on behalf of SAAB.

<sup>\*</sup> Corresponding author at: US Geological Survey, Western Ecological Research Center, Sequoia Field Station, Three Rivers, CA 93271, USA.

2

# **ARTICLE IN PRESS**

J.E. Keeley, J.G. Pausas / South African Journal of Botany xxx (2016) xxx-xxx

of smoke as the medium of transfer rather than water leached from charred wood. He noted the similarity between his studies and those from California. Subsequent studies have revealed that the combustion products from burning biomass of a wide variety of woody plants in California chaparral and South African fynbos will stimulate germination of species restricted to postfire environments. In addition, it is apparent that the response is the same with both smoke and charred wood (Brown, 1993; Keeley and Bond, 1997; Van Staden et al., 2000). Indeed, it has been shown that the postfire *Emmenanthe penduliflora*, which is deeply dormant, will germinate readily in response to direct application of ground up charred wood, a water extract of charred wood, smoke, a water extract of smoke, or vapors from smoke-treated sediments (Fig. 1). This has also been demonstrated for South African fynbos species. The role of combustion products in stimulating germination has now also been widely demonstrated in Australia (e.g, Dixon et al., 1995) and the Mediterranean Basin (e.g., Moreira et al., 2010). Since de Lange and Boucher's report, researchers have used the term 'smoke'-stimulated germination, and because it is more succinct than 'combustion product' stimulated germination we will follow that convention here.

### 2. Combustion products that stimulate germination

In recent years, a lot of effort by numerous labs has gone into trying to determine which components in smoke stimulate germination. It is now apparent, after two decades of work, that many chemicals in smoke stimulate germination. There is clear evidence that there are both inorganic and organic chemicals generated or released by smoke that will stimulate germination of seeds of plants that exhibit firestimulated germination.

The first report of a compound in smoke that stimulated germination was in 1997 and it showed that nitrogen dioxide, at levels that occur in smoke, can generate 100% germination in the chaparral annual *Emmenanthe penduliflora* (Keeley and Fotheringham, 1997). Seeds of this species are deeply dormant but brief treatment with smoke can trigger 100% germination (Fig. 1), and comparable germination with 500 ppm NO<sub>2</sub> produces a remarkably similar response (Fig. 2). However, it was also found that not all pyroendemics in chaparral responded to this gas and thus it was apparent that other chemicals were also active germination stimulants in smoke and charred wood (Keeley and Fotheringham, 2000). A number of lines of evidence support the idea that nitrogen oxides affect the differential permeability of a sub-testa cuticle (Keeley and Fotheringham, 1997; Egerton-Warburton, 1998),



**Fig. 1.** Germination of the chaparral pyroendemic *Emmenanthe pendulifera* for control (O) and smoke treatments of 1- or 10 min exposures for direct treatments (smoke-treated seeds incubated on nontreated filter paper) and indirect treatments (untreated seeds incubated on smoke-treated sand or filter paper or untreated seeds incubated with smoke water or exposed to gases emitted by smoke-treated filter paper. From Keeley and Fotheringham (1997).



**Fig. 2.** Germination of the chaparral pyroendemic *Emmenanthe pendulifera* for control (O) and NO<sub>2</sub> (7.7 g m<sup>-3</sup>) treatments of .5 or 5 min exposures for direct treatment or indirect treatments, untreated seeds incubated on NO<sub>2</sub> treated sand or filter paper on untreated filter paper with water exposed to NO<sub>2</sub> or untreated seeds or exposed to vapors emitted from NO<sub>2</sub> treated filter paper. From Keelev and Fotheringham (1997).

[however, Baldwin et al. (2005), discounted the idea]). It has been shown that both smoke in which nitrogen oxides are removed, or of insufficient fire intensity to generate nitrogen oxides, will still stimulate germination of *Emmenanthe* and other smoke-stimulated species (Light and Van Staden, 2003; Preston et al., 2004). Such studies, of course, do not rule out a role for nitrogen oxides in smoke stimulated germination, but rather support the hypothesis that multiple chemicals in smoke are involved. Other nitrogenous compounds resulting from biomass combustion appear to have a role in smoke-stimulated germination of pyroendemics include glyceronitrile (cyanohydrin), which can lead to nitrogen oxide formation (Flematti et al., 2011; Downes et al., 2014).

Organic chemists searched for organic molecules in smoke responsible for germination, and finally, in 2004, two independent studies reported the finding of an organic molecule in a class known as butanolides, which had highly stimulatory activity in triggering germination of postfire recruiting species (Flematti et al., 2004; Van Staden et al., 2004). This chemical known as karrikin has stirred huge interest because, in addition to triggering germination of *some* deeply dormant pyroendemics, it enhances germination and changes light dependent germination characteristics of many agriculturally important weeds and domesticated species (Daws et al., 2007).

This karrikin compound has gained attention as "*the* compound in smoke" responsible for promoting seed germination of postfire species (Flematti et al., 2007, 2009). However, much of the literature suggests that smoke-stimulated germination is a far more complex trait and supports the idea that multiple compounds in smoke can stimulate germination. Indeed, there are a number of species that are stimulated to germinate in response to smoke, but karrikin is clearly not the responsible compound (Daws et al., 2007; Downes et al., 2010, 2014).

Karrikin is not responsible for this response in many species (Table 1), and additionally elutions of stimulatory compounds from smoke demonstrate clearly that there are many other organic compounds in smoke that trigger germination (van Staden et al., 1995). Although under laboratory conditions karrikin is more active, this difference may not be meaningful under field conditions than many of the other elutions showing stimulatory activity. Also, karrikin has been shown to be broken down when exposed to solar irradiation (Scaffidi et al., 2012), further raising questions of its efficacy in the field. In addition to the role of inorganic compounds in smoke, there are complex ecological interactions between stimulatory compounds in smoke and the presence of soil inhibitors which are degraded by fire (Egerton-Warburton and Ghisalberti, 2001; Krock et al., 2002). Furthermore, signals such as nitrogen oxides may be generated for six

### Table 1

Examples of genera with species that show germination stimulated by smoke and in which both N-based compounds and karrikins have been tested.

Response	Response to N-based compounds		
to karrikins	Yes	No	
Yes	Andersonia (Ericaceae) [1] Emmenanthe (Boraginaceae) [1] Ficinia (Cyperaceae) [1] Conostylis (Haemodoraceae) [4]	Stylidium (Stylidiaceae) [1] Blancoa (Haemodoraceae) [2] Conostylis (Haemodoraceae) [4]	
No	Rhodocoma (Restionaceae) [1] Anigozanthos (Haemodoraceae) [1,2,3] Capsella (Brassicaceae) [5]	Gyrostemon (Gyrostemonaceae) [3]	
1 Flematti et al 2 Downes et al			

2 Downes et al., 2012

- 3 Downes et al., 2013.
- 4 Downes et al., 2015.

5 Daws et al., 2007.

months after fire from burned soils (Anderson and Levine, 1988). In light of all of these factors, we need to be prudent in extrapolating these laboratory results, particularly those involving agricultural species, to the role of smoke in the germination of pyroendemics.

#### 3. Evolution

Bradshaw et al. (2011) have contended that postfire recruitment species do not represent an adaptation to fire but rather an exaptation arising from deep seated evolutionary change in primary metabolism. They point out that 2500 species in a vast phylogenetic range have been shown to respond to smoke; though it should be noted that only a small subset of these species exhibit a dependence on smoke for germination as many merely exhibit increased germination or increased growth rates with smoke. Studies that show a mere increase in germination in response to smoke are very hard to interpret in terms of their ecological significance since doses experienced under field conditions are critical to understanding their adaptive significance. In addition, finding a positive smoke response in species that do not live in a fire-prone ecosystem (e.g., Pierce et al., 1995; Daws et al., 2007), may be interesting from a physiological point of view, but can hardly be used to explain the evolutionary relevance of how pyroendemics have exploited this signal for postfire recruitment.

Bradshaw et al. (2011) further contend that all postfire species also respond to soil disturbance and therefore there is some common factor in recently burned and recently disturbed soil. However, communities following simple soil disturbance are different from postfire communities (e.g., Roche et al., 1997; Keeley et al., 2012). Bradshaw et al. further speculate that the postfire response is related to ethylene generation, although they cite no data to support such a conclusion and ignore reports of smoke-induced responses shown not to be due to ethylene (Keeley, 1993). They then go on to propose a model of smoke-induced germination that hypothesizes that after disturbance of any type, microbes produce karrikinolide, "the responsible chemical in smoke." They speculate that, after any disturbance, microbes generate karrikinolide and this triggers germination. In their words, because of the very wide phylogenetic spread of species responding to karrikinolide, which includes major clades from monocots to dicots, this trait probably was an early development in the evolution of angiosperms. Thus, this response has been present for hundreds of millions of years but just since the middle Cenozoic, when in their view fire suddenly appeared on the scene, it was pre-empted for cueing germination to postfire conditions (this issue of adaptation vs exaptation is explored more fully in Keeley et al., 2011).

A somewhat similar model was proposed by Flematti et al. (2015), although they accept the evidence that fires have been a feature of the Earth since land plants evolved, over 400 million years ago (Pausas

and Keeley, 2009). Consistent with previous work by this Flematti, it is assumed that there is only one chemical in smoke that postfire species respond to, namely karrikin. They point out that the KA12 gene responsible for the signaling system in plants can be traced back to the earliest plants. In their view this gene first evolved in response to either karrikins or the closely related strigolactones (following soil disturbance) and has been passed down throughout land plant evolution and is not a trait specifically evolved in response to fire.



**Fig. 3.** Phylogenetic tree of plant families with evidence of smoke-stimulated germination suggests that this trait is phylogenetically widespread (x-axis in millions of years). Figure updated from Pausas and Keeley (2009); phylogenetic relatedness based on APG-III (2009).

J.E. Keeley, J.G. Pausas / South African Journal of Botany xxx (2016) xxx-xxx

An alternative hypothesis is that smoke-stimulated germination is an example of convergent evolution that has evolved multiple times in response to a variety of organic and inorganic chemical triggers in smoke (Keeley and Bond, 1997; Pausas and Keeley, 2009). The fact that the trait occurs in several of the geographically separate mediterranean climate ecosystems and in a wide diversity of taxa suggests a convergent evolution mode (Fig. 3). To support this view is the experimental evidence that multiple products of smoke are shown to trigger germination, including many unidentified organic compounds that are not associated with the karrikin elution in separation techniques.

Other evidence supporting the convergent evolution model come from the remarkable similarity between the mode of action of karrikins and the structurally similar strigolactones (Daws et al., 2008), chemical triggers important in the germination of root parasites. The very recent report by Conn et al. (2015) shows that the karrikin gene KA12 underwent convergent evolution enabling developmental responses to strigolactones in angiosperms and host detection in parasites on multiple independent origins. We hypothesize the same is true for the evolution of both karrikin dependent and non-karrikin dependent germination of pyroendemics.

Of perhaps greater importance is the fact that a vast majority of adaptive traits in plants have been shown to be the result of convergent evolution. For example, metabolic pathways such as C<sub>4</sub> photosynthesis share many similarities across unrelated clades but the specific pathways are sufficiently different to support a hypothesis of multiple origins. When it comes to other fire related traits such as serotiny, heat stimulated germination of hard seeded species and others, the evidence is over-whelming that globally these are the result of convergent evolution (Keeley et al., 2011).

We support the adaptive evolution model for smoke stimulated germination as suggested by the evolutionary perspectives in Van Staden et al. (2000); Pausas and Keeley (2009), and Lamont and He (2012). This trait is found in widely disparate parts of the world in widely separate clades and the better supported hypothesis is this evolved in response to different mutations that occurred in different clades at different times as selected by changes in local fire regimes.

### Acknowlegements

We thank USGS Ecosystems Mission Area and the PROMETEO/2016/ 021 funding and project support. Any use of trade, product, or firm names is for descriptive purposes only and does not imply endorsement by the U.S. Government.

#### References

- Anderson, I.C., Levine, J.S., 1988. Enhanced biogenic emissions of nitric oxide and nitrous oxide following surface biomass burning. Journal of Geophysical Research – Atmospheres 93, 3893–3898.
- APG-III, 2009. An update of the Angiosperm Phylogeny Group classification for the orders and families of flowering plants; APG III. Botanical Journal of the Linnean Society 161, 105–121.
- Baldwin, I.T., Preston, C.A., Krock, B., 2005. Smoke and mirrors: reply to Fotheringham and Keeley. Seed Science Research 15, 375.
- Bradshaw, S., Dixon, K., Hopper, S., Lambers, H., Turner, S., 2011. Little evidence for fireadapted plant traits in Mediterranean climate regions. Trends in Plant Science 16, 69–76.
- Brown, N.A.C., 1993. Seed germination in the fynbos fire ephemeral, Syncarpha vestita (L) B. Nord. is promoted by smoke, aqueous extracts of smoke and charred wood derived from burning the ericoid-leaved shrub, *Passerina vulgaris* Thoday. International Journal of Wildland Fire 3, 203–206.
- Conn, C.E., Bythell-Douglas, R., Neumann, D., Yoshida, S., Whittington, B., Westwood, J.H., Shirasu, K., Bond, C.S., Dyer, K.A., Nelson, D.C., 2015. Convergent evolution of strigolactone perception enabled host detection in parasitic plants. Science 349, 540–544.
- Daws, M.I., Davies, J., Pritchard, H.W., Brown, N.A.C., Van Staden, J., 2007. Butenolide from plant-derived smoke enhances germination and seedling growth of arable weed species. Plant Growth Regulation 51, 73–82.
- Daws, J.J., Pritchard, H.W., Van Staden, J., 2008. Butenolide from plant-derived smoke functions as a strigolactone analogue: evidence from parasite weed seed germination. South African Journal of Botany 74, 116–120.

- De Lange, J.H., Boucher, C., 1990. Autecological studies on *Audouinia capitata* (Bruniaceae). I. Plant-derived smoke as a seed germination cue. South African Journal of Botany 56, 700–703.
- Dixon, K.W., Roche, S., Pate, J.S., 1995. The promotive effect of smoke derived from burnt native vegetation on seed germination of Western Australian plants. Oecologia 101, 185–192.
- Downes, K.S., Lamont, B.B., Light, M.E., Van Staden, J., 2010. The fire ephemeral *Tersonia cyathiflora* (Gyrostemonaceae) germinates in response to smoke but not the butenolide 3-methyl-2H-furo [2, 3-c] pyran-2-one. Annals of Botany 106, 381–384.
- Downes, K.S., Light, M.E., Posta, M., Kohout, L., Van Staden, J., 2013. Comparison of germination responses of Anigozanthos flavidus (Haemodoraceae), Gyrostemon racemiger and Gyrostemon ramulosus (Gyrostemonaceae) to smoke-water and the smokederived compounds karrikinolide (KAR<sub>1</sub>) and glyceronitrile. Annals of Botany 111, 489–497.
- Downes, K.S., Light, M.E., Posta, M., Kohout, L., Van Staden, J., 2014. Do fire-related cues, including smoke-water, karriknolide, glyceronitle and nitrae, stimulate the germination of 17 Anigozanthos taxa and Blancoa canescens (Haemodoraceae)? Australian Journal of Botany 62, 347–358.
- Downes, K.S., Light, M.E., Posta, M., van Staden, J., 2015. Fire-related cues and the germination of eight *Conostylis* (Haemodoraceae) taxa, when freshly collected, after burial and after laboratory storage. Seed Science Research 25, 286–298.
- Egerton-Warburton, L.M., 1998. A smoke-induced alteration of the sub-testa cuticle in seeds of the post-fire recruiter, *Emmenanthe penduliflora* Benth. (Hydrophyllaceae). Journal of Experimental Botany 49, 1317–1327.
- Egerton-Warburton, L.M., Chisalberti, E.L., 2001. Isolation and structural identification of a germination inhibitor in fire-recruiters from the California chaparral. Journal of Chemical Ecology 27, 371–382.
- Flematti, G.R., Ghisalberti, E.L., Dixon, K.W., Trengve, R.D., 2004. A compound from smoke that promotes seed germination. Science 305, 977.
- Flematti, G.R., Ghisalberti, E.L., Dixon, K.W., Trengove, R.D., 2007. germination stimulant in smoke: isolation and identification. In: Colegate, S.M., Molyneux (Eds.), Bioactive Natural Products. CRC Press, pp. 531–534.
- Flematti, G.R., Ghisalberti, E.L., Dixon, K.W., Trengove, R.D., 2009. Identification of alkyl substituted 2H-Furo[2,3-c]pyran-2-ones as germination stimulants present in smoke. Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry 57, 9475–9480.
- Flematti, G.R., Merritt, D.J., Piggott, M.J., Trengove, R.D., Smith, S.M., Dixon, K.W., Ghisalberti, E.L., 2011. Burning vegetation produces cyanophydrins that liberate cyanide and stimulate seed germination. Nature http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/ ncomms1356.
- Flematti, G.R., Dixon, K.W., Smith, S.M., 2015. What are karrikins and how were they 'discovered' by plants. BMC Biology 13, 108. http://dx.doi.org/10.1186/s12915-015-0219-0.
- Jefferey, D.J., Homes, P.M., Rebelo, A.G., 1988. Effects of dry heat on seed germination in selected indigenous and alien legume species in South Africa. South African Journal of Botany 54, 28–34.
- Jones, C.S., Schlesinger, W.H., 1980. Emmenanthe penduliflora (Hydrophyllaceae): further consideration of germination response. Madroño 27, 122–125.
- Keeley, J.E., 1993. Smoke-induced flowering in the fire-lily Cyrtanthus ventricosus. South African Journal of Botany 59, 638.
- Keeley, J.E., Bond, W.J., 1997. Convergent seed germination in South African fynbos and Californian chaparral. Plant Ecology 133, 153–167.
- Keeley, J.E., Fotheringham, C.J., 1997. Trace gas emissions in smoke-induced germination. Science 276, 1248–1250.
- Keeley, J.E., Fotheringham, C.J., 2000. Role of fire in regeneration from seed. In: Fenner, M. (Ed.), Seeds: The Ecology of Regeneration in Plant Communities, second ed. CAB International, Oxon, UK, pp. 311–330.
- Keeley, J.E., Nitzberg, M.E., 1984. The role of charred wood in the germination of the chaparral herbs *Emmenanthe penduliflora* (Hydrophyllaceae) and *Eriophyllum confertiflorum* (Asteraceae). Madroño 31, 208–218.
- Keeley, J.E., Pausas, J.G., Rundel, P.W., Bond, W.J., Bradstock, R.A., 2011. Fire as an evolutionary pressure shaping plant traits. Trends in Plant Science 16, 406–411.
- Keeley, J.E., Bond, W.J., Bradstock, R.A., Pausas, J.G., Rundel, P.W., 2012. Fire in Mediterranean Climate Ecosystems: Ecology, Evolution and Management. Cambridge University Press 528 pp.
- Krock, B., Schmidt, S., Hertweck, C., Baldwin, I.T., 2002. Vegetation-derived abscisic acid and four terpenes enforce dormancy in seeds of the post-fire annual, *Nicotiana attenuata*. Seed Science Research 12, 239–252.
- Lamont, B.B., He, T., 2012. Fire-adapted Gondwanan Angiosperm floras evolved in the Cretaceous. Evolutionary Biology 12, 223–233.
- Light, M.E., Van Staden, J., 2003. The nitric oxide specific scavenger carboxy-PTIO does not inhibit smoke stimulated germination of Grand Rapids lettuce seeds. South African Journal of Botany 69, 217–219.
- Moreira, B., Tormo, J., Estrelles, E., Pausas, J.G., 2010. Disentangling the role of heat and smoke as germination cues in Mediterranean Basin flora. Annals of Botany 105, 627–635.
- Mott, J.J., McKeon, G.M., 1979. Effect of heat treatments in breaking hardseededness in four species of Stylosanthes. Seed Science and Technology 7, 15–25.
- Pausas, J.G., Keeley, J.E., 2009. A burning story: the role of fire in the history of life. Bioscience 59, 593–601.
- Pierce, S.M., Esler, K., Cowling, R.M., 1995. Smoke-induced germination of succulents (*Mesembryanthemaceae*) from fire-prone and fire-free habitats in South Africa. Oecologia 102, 520–522.
- Preston, C.A., Becker, R., Baldwin, I.T., 2004. Is 'NO' news good news? Nitrogen oxides are not components of smoke that elicits germination in two smoke-stimulated species, *Nicotiana attenuata* and *Emmenanthe penduliflora*. Seed Science Research 14, 73–79.

#### J.E. Keeley, J.G. Pausas / South African Journal of Botany xxx (2016) xxx-xxx

- Roche, S., Dixon, K.W., Pate, K.S., 1997. Seed ageing and smoke: partner cues in the amelioration of seed dormancy in selected Australian native species. Australian Journal of Botany 45, 783–815.
- Scaffidi, A., Waters, M.T., Skelton, B.W., Bond, C.S., Sobolev, A.N., Bythell-Douglas, R., McKinley, A.J., Dixon, K.W., Ghisalberti, E.L., Smith, S.M., Flematti, G.R., 2012. Solar irradiation of the seed germination stimulant karrikinolide produces two novel headto-head cage dimers. Organic & Biomolecular Chemistry 10, 4069–4073.
- Sweeney, J.R., 1956. Responses of vegetation to fire: a study of the herbaceous vegetation following chaparral fires. University of California Publications in Botany 28, 143–216.
  Trabaud, L., Oustric, J., 1989a. Heat requirements for seed germination of three *Cistus*
- species in the garrigue of southern France. Flora 183, 321–325.

- Trabaud, L., Oustric, J., 1989b. Comparison des stratégies de regénération après incendie chez deux espèces de ciste. Revue d'Ecologie (la Terre et la Vie) 44, 4–13.
- van Staden, Drewes, F.E., Jager, A.K., 1995. The search for germination stimulants in plantderived smoke extracts. South African Journal of Botany 61, 260–263.
- van Staden, J., Brown, N.A.C., Jager, A.K., Johnson, T.A., 2000. Smoke as a germination cue. Plant Species Biology 15, 167–178.
- van Staden, J., Jager, A.K., Light, M.E., Burger, B.V., 2004. Isolation of the major germination cue form plant-derived smoke. South African Journal of Botany 70, 654–659.
- Wicklow, D.T., 1977. Germination response in *Emmenanthe penduliflora* (Hydrophyllaceae). Ecology 58, 201–205.