True and Apparent Oxygen Permeabilities of Contact Lenses

V. COMPÀN,* J. GARRIDO,* and J. A. MANZANARES*
Department of Thermodynamics, University of Valencia, Valencia, Spain

J. ANDRÉS,* J. S. ESTEVE,* and Ma L. LÓPEZ†
Department of Experimental Sciences, Universitat Jaume I, Castellón, Spain

ABSTRACT
We studied the passage of oxygen through some commercially available contact lenses. Oxygen diffusion coefficients were determined by the time-lag method and a 201T Redher permeometer was used to measure the oxygen permeability and transmissibility by the polarographic method. The measurements were carried out at room temperature with 0.09% sodium chloride physiologic solution. The following types of lenses were tested: (1) 12 lenses of cellulose acetate butyrate (CAB) of a mean thickness of 0.194 mm (observed Dk = 6.3 barrers) (1 barrer is equivalent to $10^{-11}$ cm$^2$ of O$_2$ (STP) · cm$^2$·s·mm Hg), (2) 13 lenses of a cross-linked polyhydroxyethyl methacrylate (2-HEMA), manufactured by Lenticon and Bausch & Lomb, with 40 and 38.8% water content, respectively. The mean thicknesses were 0.160 and 0.148 mm, respectively (observed Dk = 12 to 13.5 barrers). (3) Finally 10 lenses of a copolymer of 2 HEMA with N-2-vinylpyrrolidone (2-HEMA/VP), manufactured by Bausch & Lomb under the name Hydrocurve II, with 55% water content and a mean thickness of 0.138 mm (observed Dk = 24.5 barrers). For a given lens thickness, the transmissibility and permeability of lenses whose main material is 2-HEMA are found to be equivalent. This fact suggests the use of such material as a standard in the study of diffusion processes in contact lenses of low oxygen permeability (Dk = 12 to 13.5 barrers). We studied the boundary layer effects and found significant discrepancies between true and apparent oxygen permeabilities. The apparent transmissibility decreased with increasing lens thickness, this effect being more apparent for lenses with low water content. Oxygen permeability is found to be exponentially dependent on water content rather than on the chemical composition of the hydrogel.

Key Words: contact lens, oxygen transmissibility, oxygen permeability, gas diffusion

The hydrogels are natural or synthetic hydro-

Received December 20, 1991; revision received May 15, 1992.
* Ph.D., Member of Faculty.
† Physicist.
reduced on the electrode after permeating through the lens and the filter paper or the Teflon membrane. A third procedure uses the 2-chamber method, in which the lens is clamped between the 2 chambers. Oxygen is transported from the chamber of higher to that of lower oxygen concentration, where it is reduced by an oxygen sensor. This method is a variant of the so-called time-lag method.

We measured the oxygen diffusion coefficients, transmissibilities, and permeabilities of 48 contact lenses. We used the time-lag method to obtain the oxygen diffusion coefficients. The permeability measurements were obtained with a potentiostatic cell and following the technique described by Fatt and St. Helen, which assumes that all the oxygen reaching the cathode is instantly reduced. These permeability measurements are related to the system composed by the lens and the two boundary layers and, therefore, they are called apparent permeabilities. We determined the effect of the boundary layers in order to evaluate the true permeabilities of the lenses. It is worth noting that some authors have not considered the possible effect of the boundary layers on the measurement of the oxygen permeability. But others have studied this effect and determined the thickness of these layers and calculated the true oxygen permeability of contact lenses.

FUNDAMENTALS

The oxygen passing through the sample follows the reduction process on the cathode:

\[ \text{O}_2 + 2\text{H}_2\text{O} + 4\text{e}^- \rightarrow 4\text{OH}^- \]

Oxygen transmissibility is calculated by measuring the electrical current \( I \) in the potentiographic cell through the equation

\[ \frac{Dk}{L} = \frac{I}{nFAD\rho} \]  \hspace{2cm} (1)

where \( n \) is the number of electrons involved in the reduction of 1 molecule of oxygen (in this case, \( n = 4 \)), \( F \) is the Faraday constant divided by the molar volume of the gas at standard conditions (22.4 L/mol), \( A \) is the cathode surface area, equal to the membrane surface area, and \( \Delta p \) is the oxygen partial pressure difference between the two faces of the lens (in this case, \( \Delta p = 155 \) mm Hg). Equation 1 assumes that zero oxygen concentration is maintained at the cathode surface.

Fatt and Chaston included the residual current \( I_0 \), i.e., the electrical current that was observed when no dissolved oxygen was present. Then, equation 1 can be modified to

\[ \frac{Dk}{L} = \frac{I - I_0}{nFAD\rho} \]  \hspace{2cm} (2)

where \( I - I_0 \) is called the diffusion current.

The oxygen transmissibility measured in this way is termed apparent transmissibility because it is related to the whole cell and not to the lens. The diffusion resistance of the solution layer between the sample and the electrode must also be taken into account. The true transmissibility is related to the apparent one through equation 3:

\[ \left( \frac{L}{Dk} \right)_{\text{app}} = \left( \frac{L}{Dk} \right)_{\text{lens}} + R_{b,1} \]  \hspace{2cm} (3)

where \( R_{b,1} \) is the boundary layer resistance. Thus, when several samples of the same hydrogel having different thicknesses are studied, the plot of \( (L/Dk)_{\text{app}} \) vs. lens thickness \( L \) should give a straight line, \( (L/Dk)_{\text{lens}} \) being its slope (i.e., the reciprocal of the true oxygen permeability of the hydrogel), and \( R_{b,1} \) its intercept. The oxygen permeability can be estimated by multiplying the oxygen transmissibility \( (Dk/L)_{\text{lens}} \) obtained in this way by the lens thickness. The dependence of the electric current upon the true permeability and transmissibility can also be found by substituting equation 3 into equation 2. And, finally, the thickness of the boundary layer can be obtained from the value of the solution permeability.

On the other hand, oxygen diffusion coefficients can be determined from time-lag measurements and equation 4:

\[ D = \frac{L^2}{6\theta} \]  \hspace{2cm} (4)

where \( \theta \) is the time-lag and \( L \) is the average membrane thickness. It can also be proved that the time-lag is related to the steady-state electrical current in the potentiostatic cell, \( I \), through equation 5:

\[ \theta = \frac{t_0 - q}{I} \]  \hspace{2cm} (5)

where \( t_0 \) is the time needed to reach the steady state and \( q \) the electrical charge transported during that time.

METHODS

The following types of lenses were tested: (1) 12 lenses of CAB of a mean thickness of 0.194 mm; (2) 13 lenses of a cross-linked 2-HEMA, manufactured by Lenticon and Bausch & Lomb, with 40 and 38.6% water content, respectively—the mean thicknesses were 0.160 and 0.148 mm, respectively; and (3) finally 10 lenses of a copolymer of 2-HEMA/VP, manufactured by Bausch & Lomb under the name Hydrocurve II, with 55% water content and a mean thickness of 0.135 mm. The CAB lenses, provided by Danker and Wohlk Co., are not single plastic materials. Instead, they are basically formed by a resin which has about 15% acetyl, 40% butyryl, and 2% unsubstituted hydroxyls.

The central thicknesses of the lenses, \( L \), were measured with a micrometer. The mean value of 10 measurements was obtained. Oxygen transmissibility \( Dk/L \) and permeability \( Dk \) were measured by means of a Createch Permeometer (model 201 T,
Redher Development Co., USA) designed for the accurate measurement of these quantities. The polarographic cell of the permeometer was a Schema cell (Schema Versatae, Berkeley, CA). The radius of curvature of the electrode tip was made to fit the inner surface of the lens. We used a gold cathode and a silver anode. The measurements were made at room temperature, (20 ± 1°C), in a 0.09% NaCl solution with double distilled water and the voltage was set to 0.75 V for all experimental tests. The cathode surface area A was (14.24 ± 0.13)·10⁻² cm². Further details on the potentiostatic cell can be found elsewhere.⁶,¹⁹

The polarographic method described by Fatt and St. Helen¹³ was used. This method is based on the complete reduction of the dissolved oxygen reaching the cathode surface after passing through the lens. All the measurements were conducted according to the following procedure.¹⁹ The electrodes were first moistened with a drop of 0.09% NaCl aqueous solution before adjusting the lens. Then, the lens was removed from a receptacle containing the same NaCl solution and placed on the electrodes. The vertical hollow cylinder was adjusted to the lens after inserting a piece of wet nylon. A calibrated weight was then placed on the cylinder. Next, 0.5 ml of the above-mentioned solution was introduced through the opening of the cylinder. Then, the system was exposed to a nitrogen atmosphere until a negligibly small current was observed. Finally, the system was exposed to the ambient atmosphere and the electric current reached a steady value, I.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The flow of oxygen to the cornea through a contact lens may also be retarded by the resistance due to the tear layers at the anterior and posterior surfaces of the lens. In this sense, we may obtain erroneous values that are particularly enhanced when Dk is determined from equation 2. This effect is more important for rigid than for hydrogel contact lenses.

The polarographic method used can yield values of the oxygen permeability that are lower than the true ones when applied to thin contact lenses. Measurements carried out on a set of lenses of the same material having different thicknesses can be used to obtain the true values. Also, the values of the oxygen permeability obtained from the direct determination of the electrical current may be wrong if the effect of the resistance to oxygen flow due to the boundary layers is not taken into account. Furthermore, Goldenberg et al.²¹ have observed that the Cretach Permeometer can lead to wrong results when used for ultrathin and highly oxygen-permeable silicone rubber sheets due to the nonlinear relation between electrical current and oxygen partial pressure difference (see equation 2 above). In our study of a set of commercial contact lenses used widely in Spain, we assessed the linear relation between these two magnitudes and, then, we took into account the effect of the boundary layers and the discrepancies between true and apparent oxygen permeabilities.

In order to obtain the values of the true and apparent oxygen permeability, we first register the time evolution of the diffusion current. Typical registers are presented in Fig. 1. The steady-state values of the electrical current are obtained from these plots and the apparent oxygen transmissibilities are calculated by means of equation 2. Then, the average central thickness of the lenses is measured and the apparent oxygen permeabilities are calculated as the product of the apparent oxygen transmissibility and the lens thickness. Next, the reciprocal of the apparent oxygen transmissibilities are plotted against the lens thicknesses. These plots can be seen in Fig. 2 and the corresponding linear regression parameters are shown in Table 1. According to equation 3, the true oxygen permeability is given by the reciprocal of the slope of this plot and the contribution of the boundary layers to the resistance to oxygen diffusion is related to the intercept. Finally, by assuming that the oxygen permeability of these layers is that of water, (Dk)ₙ.

![Figure 1. Diffusion current vs. time.](image)

![Figure 2. Reciprocal of apparent oxygen transmissibility vs. lens thickness for CAB (O), Lentic (X), Soflens (□) and Hydrocurve II (Δ) lenses.](image)
Table 1. Parameters of the linear regressions shown in Fig. 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lens</th>
<th>Slope (barrier⁻¹)</th>
<th>Intercept (10⁻⁶ cm/barrier)</th>
<th>Correlation Coefficient</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CAB</td>
<td>0.164 ± 0.025</td>
<td>2 ± 4</td>
<td>0.99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soflens</td>
<td>0.089 ± 0.010</td>
<td>0.6 ± 1.4</td>
<td>0.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lenticon</td>
<td>0.083 ± 0.018</td>
<td>1 ± 3</td>
<td>0.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hydrocurve II</td>
<td>0.049 ± 0.004</td>
<td>1.1 ± 0.6</td>
<td>0.97</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\( \approx (Dk)_b = 79 \) barrers,\(^{18,20} \) the thicknesses of the boundary layers are computed.

Table 2 shows the results obtained for the true and apparent oxygen permeability and the thickness of the boundary layers. In this table it can be observed that lenses with high water content also show high oxygen permeability. Furthermore, the relative differences between true and apparent oxygen permeabilities also seem to be related to the water content, being greater for thin lenses with a high water content. Then, we can deduce that the effect of the boundary layers on the experimentally observed oxygen permeability is important for lenses with high water content, small thickness, and high oxygen permeability. The thickness of the boundary layers in the lenses evaluated are thicker than the tear film. Thus, a given contact lens placed in the eye will transmit somewhat more oxygen to the cornea than the amount determined in our experimental set-up, in which the boundary layer resistances are larger than the ones due to the tear film, even though we assume that the tear film is constituted like bulk water, which it certainly is not.

Table 2 also shows the oxygen diffusion coefficient obtained from time-lag measurements and equation 4. The time-lag has been determined from the diffusion current registers (Fig. 1).\(^{22} \) This time is characteristic of the lens and is only slightly different from one lens to another. The results in Table 2 show that the value of the oxygen diffusion coefficient is high for lenses with a high water content. As compared with the other lenses, Hydrocurve II lenses (distributed by Bausch & Lomb) offer the minimum resistance to the transit of oxygen. Their diffusion coefficient is 36% higher than those of Lenticon and Soflens lenses. On the other hand, we see that the contact lenses of the same material but from different manufacturers present slightly different values for the oxygen permeability and the oxygen diffusion coefficient. Finally, CAB lenses, although substantially more oxygen-permeable than the conventional hard lenses, show lower oxygen permeability than hydrogel lenses because of their lower water content.

In view of the relatively high uncertainties of the \( L_{la} \) values in Table 2, we should consider them as rough estimates showing the characteristic order of magnitude. The analysis of a larger number of lenses could certainly improve these results, but this paper emphasizes the measurement of the permeabilities, and the latter shows reasonable uncertainties.

From the above results, we can consider 2-HEMA as a standard material for the determination of the oxygen transmissibility and permeability of hydrogel contact lenses. However, it could not be considered as a general standard material because of the problems in comparing the permeability of a soft contact lens material with a rigid gas permeable material (e.g., boundary layer effects, etc.). The relative differences between true and apparent oxygen permeabilities never exceed 10% for this material and they may be due to the thickness of the boundary layer. This thickness may vary from one experiment to another because of slight changes in pressure, temperature, and lens humectability. Other factors that are thought to contribute to experimental errors in the determination of the material permeability include sorption and desorption effects and unstirred boundary layers on the surface of the lens.\(^{23} \)

The resistance to oxygen flow due to the boundary layers is found to be smaller for membranes treated by N-((1,1-dimethyl-3-oxobuthyl) acrylamide (also known as diaceto acrylamide) and 2-ethyl-2(hydroxymethyl)-1,3 propanediol than for nontreated membranes (2-HEMA). The results obtained here for the boundary layers' thicknesses (Table 2) are not very different from those by Yang et al.\(^{24} \)

In order to study which is the control mechanism of the oxygen diffusion through the lens-dissolution system, we have introduced a generalization of the criterion given by Helfferich\(^{25} \) to find whether the control of the diffusion process is exerted by the lens or the boundary layers. The procedure is based on an estimation of the ratio

\[
\frac{(Dk)_{b,1}P_L}{(Dk)_{lens}P_{solv}}
\]

where \( (Dk)_{lens} \) is the oxygen permeabilities of the lens, \( (Dk)_{b,1} \) that of the boundary layers, \( P_L \) the average oxygen partial pressure in the air in equilibrium with the sodium chloride solution, \( P_{solv} \) the

Table 2. True and apparent permeabilities and their relative difference of some hydrogel contact lenses.\(^a\)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Brand Name</th>
<th>Main Material</th>
<th>Water Content (%)</th>
<th>( (Dk)_{b,1} ) (barrers)</th>
<th>( (Dk)_{lens} ) (barrers)</th>
<th>Difference (%)</th>
<th>( L_{la} ) (( \mu )m)</th>
<th>( D ) (10⁻⁷ cm²/s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CAB</td>
<td>CAB</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>6.3 ± 0.6</td>
<td>6.7 ± 0.9</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>200 ± 300</td>
<td>2.30 ± 0.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soflens</td>
<td>2-HEMA</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>11.2 ± 1.6</td>
<td>12.1 ± 1.4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>50 ± 100</td>
<td>2.71 ± 0.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lenticon</td>
<td>2-HEMA</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>12.1 ± 1.8</td>
<td>13.1 ± 1.2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>80 ± 200</td>
<td>2.52 ± 0.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hydrocurve II</td>
<td>2-HEMA/VP</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>20.5 ± 2.0</td>
<td>24.5 ± 2.5</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>90 ± 50</td>
<td>3.97 ± 0.20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^a\) Oxygen diffusion coefficients and lens thicknesses are also included. Standard deviations from average values are shown.
oxygen partial pressure in the boundary layers, and 
L and \( \delta \) the lens and boundary layers’ thicknesses, 
respectively. If the ratio (6) is much greater than 1, 
the pressure gradient is mostly maintained by the 

With the given value for \( (Dk)_{\text{b,1}} \) and the thick-
nesses and permeabilities corresponding to the 
lenses studied (Table 1), we see that the ratio (6) 
takes values from 5 to 25 times \( p^0/p_{\text{rens}} \). On the 
other hand, \( p^0 \approx 155 \text{ mm Hg} \geq p_{\text{rens}} \) and then this 
ratio is always much greater than one. Neverthe-
less, the ratio takes very different values from one 

Finally, we also studied the relation between 
the permeability and the water content of the 
lenses. Our results shown in Fig. 3 suggest an exponential 
dependence of the permeability (Dk in barrels) on 
the water content \( w \) (in percent).

\[
Dk = 1.62e^{0.0504w} (r = 0.993).
\]

It is worth noting that we have not studied lenses 
with very high water content\(^{21}\) and, consequently, 
the range of values of the water content in Fig. 3 is 
so small that both linear and exponential relations 
could be suggested. However, we decided to use the 
exponential dependence because it has already been 
observed by other researchers.\(^{8}\) In any case, our 
results and those previously reported by different 
authors\(^{5,10,15,21}\) (summarized in Table 3) show that 
the water content of the lens is a key parameter.

\begin{figure}
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{fig3}
\caption{Figure 3. True or intrinsic permeability vs. water content.}
\end{figure}

\begin{table}
\centering
\begin{tabular}{|c|cc|c|}
\hline
Main Material & CAB & 2-HEMA & 2-HEMA/VP & Reference \\
\hline
\begin{tabular}{c}
(Dk)\(_{\text{b,1}}\) (barrers) \\
6 & 12–13 & 20–24 & This paper \\
5–8 & 9–11 & 16–19 & 4, 6, 12 \\
5–6 & 8–10 & 6–13* & 8, 9 \\
- & 10 & 16–17 & 15 \\
\end{tabular} & \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
\caption{Comparison of apparent permeability values (in barrels) obtained by different authors.\(^{5}\)}
\end{table}

\section*{CONCLUSIONS}
The oxygen permeability and diffusion coeffi-
cient increase with the water content and the thick-
ness of the lens, although the effect of the boundary 
layers is also more important for thick lenses. This 
dependence on water content can be used to obtain 
a first approximation for the permeability of new 
materials. However, the well-known differences in 
bound to free water as total water content changes 
make it impossible to have a reliable estimate for the 

It would be quite interesting to have a standard 
method for the determination of the oxygen perme-
ability of hydrogel contact lenses. We think that 
such a method should use 2-HEMA as a reference 
material because these lenses give a very reproduc-
ible value for the oxygen permeability. Furthemore, 
lenses based on 2-HEMA from different manu-
ufacturers show similar oxygen permeabilities. 
From the point of view of measurements, hydrogel 
contact lenses are also very convenient because 
there is no need to introduce any cigarette paper or 
Teflon membrane between the lens and the electrode.

Materials containing VP show a very high oxygen 
permeability thanks to their thickness and water 
content, the effect of the boundary layers being 
much less important for them than for the other 
materials studied. Therefore, they should be consid-
ered preferentially. Nevertheless the physiological 
response of the patient will certainly influence the 
choice of one lens or another.

\section*{ACKNOWLEDGMENTS}
We gratefully acknowledge the discussions and revision of the 
manuscript with Prof. M. F. Rejojo (Eye Research Institute of the 
Retina Foundation, Boston). Financial support from DGICYT (Min-
istry of Education and Science of Spain) under project No. 
GG-0085 is also acknowledged.

\section*{REFERENCES}
1. Pedley G, Skelly PJ, Tighe BJ. Hydrogels in biomedical appli-
2. Grote J, Zander R. Corneal oxygen supply conditions. Adv 
3. Holden BA, Sweeney DF, Sanderson G. The minimum pre-
corneal oxygen tension to avoid corneal edema. Invest 
4. Hwang S-T, Kamermeyer K. Effect of thickness on perme-
ability. In: Hopfenberg HB, ed. Permeability of Plastic Films 
and Coatings to Gases, Vapors and Liquids. Polymer Science 
5. Fatt I, Chaston J. Measurement of oxygen transmissibility 
and permeability of hydrogel lenses and materials. ICLC 
6. Fatt I. Oxygen transmissibility and permeability of gas perme-
able hard contact lenses and materials. ICLC 1984;11:175– 
87.
7. Brennan NA, Efron N, Holden BA. Oxygen permeability of 
hard gas permeable contact lens materials. Clin Exp Optom 
1986;89:82–9.
H, LaToot D, Brennan NA, Efron N. The Dk project: an 
interaboratory comparison of Dk/L measurements. Optom 
9. Rejojo MF, Leong F-L. Water-dissolved oxygen permeability 
coefficients of hydrogel contact lenses and boundary layer 

Oxygen Permeability of Contact Lenses—Compañ et al. 689


AUTHOR’S ADDRESS:
Vicente Compan
Department of Experimental Sciences
Universitat Jaume I
Apartat 224
12080 Castellon
Spain

UPCOMING EVENTS

The 15th Annual Wilmer Institute Current Concepts in Ophthalmology will be held on February 7 to 12, 1993 at the Hyatt Regency Cerromar Beach Hotel, Dorado, Puerto Rico.

Contact: Program Coordinator
Johns Hopkins Medical Institutions
Office of Continuing Education, Turner Building
720 Rutland Ave.
Baltimore, MD 21205-2195
Phone (410) 955-2959

The 10th Annual Wilmer Institute Current Concepts in Ophthalmology will be held on March 14 to 19, 1993 at the Manor Vail Lodge, Vail, Colorado.

Contact: Program Coordinator
Johns Hopkins Medical Institutions
Office of Continuing Education, Turner Building
720 Rutland Ave.
Baltimore, MD 21205-2195
Phone (410) 955-2959

690 OPTOMETRY & VISION SCIENCE